

**Minutes of the meeting of Technical Evaluation of Bid with respect to Request for Proposal for hiring services of Chartered Accountants firms/Cost Accountants firms for Internal Audit of BMSICL for Financial year 2016-17 & 2017-18 held on 27<sup>th</sup> April, 2018 at 4.00 pm at conference hall of BMSICL.**

**Members Present:**

1. Shri Sudhir Kumar, General Manager (Finance)
2. Shri Sunil Kumar, General Manager (Logistics)
3. Shri Manish Kumar Sinha, Deputy General Manager (Admin)
4. Ms. Puja Sinha, Company Secretary
5. Shri Mahesh Kumar Atri, Manager (Finance)

A. For hiring services of Chartered Accountants firms/Cost Accountants firms for Internal Audit of BMSICL for Financial year 2016-17 & 2017-18, Request for Proposal was published in different editions of leading newspapers and at IPRD website on 18/11/2017 through RFP no. BMSIC/30045/1-2013/3006. For incorporating the suggestions of prospective bidders which was collected during pre-bid meeting held on 06<sup>th</sup> December 2017, last date for accepting techno-financial bid was extended to 21<sup>st</sup> December 2017 till 2.00pm.

B. Till the above stipulated time altogether, 23 (Twenty Three) Techno-financial bids were received from the following mentioned Chartered Accountant /Cost Accountant firms:

1. Chanakya Ashok & Co.
2. Raj Har Gopal & Co.
3. A.J.S. & Associates
4. K.K. Chanani & Associates
5. Sadana & Co.
6. Thakur Bhuwanesh & Associates
7. R.M. Associates
8. S.K. Patodia & Associates
9. Anjali Jain & Associates
10. Gupta Sachdeva & Co.
11. K.hari Ji & Co.
12. SASD & Co.
13. Goyal parul & Co.
14. R.N. Sinha & Co.
15. C.K. Prusty & Associates
16. G.K. Sureka & Co.
17. U.S. Prasad & Co.
18. Jaiswal Brajesh & Co.
19. V.Rohatgi & Co.
20. Anil Ajay & Co.
21. S.K. Agarwal & Co.
22. P.Jyoti & Co.
23. Marodia Khanna & Associates

C. Among the above mentioned parties, bid security in the form of Demand Draft was not received from the following firms:

1. S.K. Agarwal & Co.
2. P.Jyoti & Co.
3. Marodia Khanna & Associates

*Basil*  
27/4/18

*ML*  
27/4/18

*f*

*ML*  
27/4/18

Hence, the three firms were declared disqualified in the meeting of the Committee held on 10<sup>th</sup> April 2018.

D. Members of Technical Evaluation Committee in the meeting held on 10<sup>th</sup> April 2018 decided to publish the minutes of meeting on the website of BMSICL in order to invite claims and objections with documentary proof from rest of the firms and also to forward the Comparative Evaluation Sheet to all concerned firms.

E. Accordingly, the minutes of the Committee meeting dated 10/04/2018 was published on the official website of BMSICL and comparative evaluation sheet was forwarded to the concerned firms on 17<sup>th</sup> April 2018 in order to invite claims and objections. The comparative analysis of the replies received from the firms is as following:-

<b>Combined evaluation sheet cum comparative chart</b>				
<b>S.No.</b>	<b>Name of the bidder</b>	<b>Evaluation Sheet Comment</b>	<b>Reply/ Clarification</b>	<b>Remarks</b>
1	Chanakya Ashok & Co.	(i) Form 1C(A) not submitted in correct format	Declaration in respect of Form 1C (A) submitted.	Firm is now fulfilling the criteria mentioned in the RFP.
2	Raj Har Gopal & Co.	(i) Audit Report along with Income & Expenditure/Receipt & Payment Account & Balance Sheet not submitted for F.Y. 2013-14. (ii) Service tax Return of F.Y. 2013-14, 2014-15 & F.Y. 2015-16 not submitted	Documents submitted	Firm is now fulfilling the criteria mentioned in the RFP.
3	A.J.S. & Associates	(i) Service tax Return of F.Y. 2013-14, 2014-15 & F.Y. 2015-16 not submitted (ii) Undertaking submitted on letterhead of the company in place of affidavit.	(i) Affidavit on stamp paper dated 14/12/2017 submitted. (ii) Service tax return submitted.	Firm is now fulfilling the criteria mentioned in the RFP.
4	K.K. Chanani & Associates	(i) Service tax Return of F.Y. 2013-14, 2014-15 & F.Y. 2015-16 not submitted (ii) Affidavit submitted on letterhead of the company in place of Stamp paper.	(i) Affidavit on stamp paper dated 13/12/2017 submitted. (ii) Service tax return submitted.	Firm is now fulfilling the criteria mentioned in the RFP.
5	Sadana & Co.	(i) Affidavit not Submitted	Affidavit submitted	Firm is now fulfilling the criteria mentioned in the RFP.

*[Handwritten signature]*

*[Handwritten signature]*

*[Handwritten signature]*

*[Handwritten signature]*

