

Minutes of Meeting

Technical Committee Meeting to decide on the objections received against the published Technical Evaluation Report of Tender No. BMSIC/20045/1-2019/01 ('Selection of Agency for Outsourcing Different Job Profiles for 'Bihar Medical Services and Infrastructure Corporation Limited').

1. With reference to the Notice Inviting Tender (NIT) Reference No.: - BMSIC/20045/1-2019/01 for Selection of Agency for Outsourcing Different Job Profiles for 'Bihar Medical Services and Infrastructure Corporation Limited', published in leading newspapers and uploaded on the website "<http://www.eproc.bihar.gov.in/BELTRON>", the Technical Committee Meeting to decide on the objections received against the published Technical Evaluation Report of **Tender No. BMSIC/20045/1-2019/01** was held at 11:00 am on 14/08/2019 at the Patna office of 'Bihar Medical Services & Infrastructure Corporation Limited (BMSICL)'.
2. The following members of the Technical Committee were present in the Meeting:-
 - (i) Shri Khalid Arshad ^{BAS}, Administrative Officer, State Health Society, Bihar
 - (ii) Shri Sunil K Singh, GM (Procurement), BMSICL
 - (iii) Shri Ram Sundar Sharma, DGM (Finance), BMSICL
 - (iv) Shri Manish Sinha, DGM (Admin), BMSICL
 - (v) Shri Mahesh Atri, Manager (Finance), BMSICL
 - (vi) Shri Sanjeev Ranjan, Manager (Logistics), BMSICL
3. The technical bids of six bidders – Biswas Security Services India Pvt. Ltd, Corporate Housekeeping Services India Pvt. Ltd., Cobra Industrial Security Force (India) Ltd, Frontline NCR Business Solution Pvt. Ltd, M4 Solutions Pvt. Ltd and Impressions Services Pvt. Ltd were received before the stipulated time and date and were opened on e-proc on 30/04/2019.
4. Post evaluation of the technical bids of the above six bidders, the Technical Bid Evaluation Sheet was uploaded on the website of BMSICL and the detailed break-up of bidder's experience (clients, manpower count etc.) was sent to individual bidders vide e-mail asking them to submit clarifications and objections if any till 10.7.2019.
5. Following the above, clarifications and documents were received from all six bidders. Meeting of the Technical Evaluation Committee was held on 29.07.2019 wherein the committee perused the documents received and based on the terms and conditions of the tender the final evaluation of bids was done. Post evaluation, three bidders – Corporate Housekeeping Services India Pvt. Ltd, Frontline NCR Business Solution and Impressions Services Pvt. Ltd. were declared as technically qualified whereas the other three bidders - Biswas Security Services India Pvt. Ltd, Cobra Industrial Security Force (India) Ltd and M4 Solutions Pvt. Ltd were declared as technically disqualified. The final Technical Bid Evaluation Sheet was uploaded on the website of BMSICL asking the

bidders to submit their Objections (if any) vide e-mail till 8th August 2019 based on their submitted technical bids only.

6. No objections from any of the six bidders was received till the above stipulated timeline, however one Mr. Raju Pandey in his personal capacity sent an e-mail on 8th August 2019 raising objection that bidders Corporate Housekeeping Services India Pvt. Ltd and Impressions Services Pvt. Ltd. do not possess license under Bihar Private Security Agencies (Regulation) Act, 2015 and further as per clause 7 of tender they have not complied with the condition of tender i.e. source security guards from security firm having such license. Mr. Raju Pandey sent another e-mail on 13th August 2019 i.e. 5 days after the stipulated timeline, vide his email he claimed that clause 7 of the tender is against the Bihar Private Security Agencies (Regulation) Act, 2015.
7. The Technical Committee observed that Mr. Raju Pandey is an unrelated party to the bid and he has not declared whether he is writing on behalf of any bidder. However the committee still perused his objection mail dated 8th August 2019. In this regard Clause 7 (b) under Section III of the tender is quoted as below:

“For the request of outsourcing security guards, if the agency doesn’t hold a license under Bihar Private Securities Agencies (Regulation) Act 2015, the Agency will source the same from a security firm having license in accordance with the ‘*Bihar Private Securities Agencies (Regulation) Act, 2015*’ in the state (as per section 4&7 of the Private Security Regulation Act (PSRA) 2005 GoI).

The selected agency will share the details of concerned security firm with the BMSICL, and share a copy of security firm’s BPSA license.”

It is absolutely clear from the above clause that the tender has an in-built provision for agencies not possessing BPSA license to source guards from firm having such license. Further only the selected agency is required to share the details of the concerned security firm, hence it is obvious only after the agency has been selected, it has to share a copy of the security firm’s BPSA license. This provision has been reiterated in the terms and conditions under clause 8 (b) of Section V of the tender which is quoted as below:

“Notwithstanding the aforesaid, the Service Provider may have a right to subcontract/ avail the services as mentioned below: ---

-----Providing security guards for deployment at BMSICL office(s), warehouses and other related entities, if the agency doesn’t hold a license under Bihar Private Securities Agencies (Regulation) Act 2015. The security guards must be sourced through security firms registered under Bihar Private Securities Agencies (Regulation) Act 2015 in the state [*as per section 4&7 of the Private Security Regulation Act (PSRA) 2005 GoI*]. However, note that this sub-contracting will be allowed only if the agency doesn’t hold a license under ‘Bihar Private Securities Agencies (Regulation) Act 2015’.

8. In view of the clearly laid out provisions of the tender for sourcing of guards by agency from a security firm having BPSA license, the objection of Raju Pandey received vide his e-mail dated 8th Aug 2019 was found to be without any basis. Moreover Raju Pandey

(who has not even participated in the tender process) has raised objection on the tender clause at this stage when the final technical evaluation of the bids has been completed and when objections have been invited on the final technical bid evaluation sheet. Prior to this when the tender had been published or at the pre-bid stage, no objection regarding this clause of the tender was received from any source. In light of the above reasons the committee rejected the objection of Raju Pandey. Further as the subsequent e-mail of Raju Pandey was received on 13th Aug 2019 i.e. 5 days after the stipulated timeline, the committee decided not to consider the same.

9. Hence the Technical Evaluation Committee decided that the earlier declared three technically qualified bidders be assigned technical scores as per clause 8.1 under Section II of the tender, the technical score sheet after assignment of scores to the three bidders is annexed as Annexure 1.
10. Based on the above, the Technical evaluation committee recommended opening of the financial bids of the following three technically qualified bidders for final selection based on QCBS method (combining technical and financial score) as per Clause 8.2 and 8.3 (Section II) of the tender:–
 - i. Corporate Housekeeping Services India Pvt. Ltd.
 - ii. Frontline NCR Business Solution Pvt. Ltd.
 - iii. Impressions Services Pvt. Ltd.
11. The meeting was concluded with a vote of thanks.

Encl: As above

Sd/- Sanjeev Ranjan Manager (Log.) BMSICL	Sd/- Mahesh Atri Manager (Finance) BMSICL	Sd/- Manish Sinha DGM (Admin) BMSICL	Sd/- Ram Sundar Sharma DGM (Finance) BMSICL
--	--	---	--

Sd/- Sunil K Singh GM (Procurement) BMSICL	Sd/- Khalid Arshad Administrative Officer SHSB
---	---

**Annexure - 1
Technical Scoresheet**

S.No	Section	Max. Marks	Corporate HKS		Frontline NCR		Impressions	
			Specifics	Score	Specifics	Score	Specifics	Score
1	Number of clients provided outsourced manpower (clients belonging to Central/ State Government Departments OR PSUs OR NGOs OR international social agencies, such as UNICEF/ WHO etc.), since April 2015 - >= 2 and <4 – 10 marks - >= 4 and <6 – 15 marks - >=6 – 20 marks	20	7	20	7	20	8	20
2	Number of outsourced manpower (on agency's payroll) provided for clients belonging to Central/ State Government Departments OR PSUs OR NGOs OR international social agencies, such as UNICEF/ WHO etc), since April 2015 - >= 100 and <200 – 15 marks - >= 200 and <300 – 20 marks - >=300 – 25 marks	25	300+	25	300+	25	300+	25
3	Number of outsourced manpower (on agency's payroll) for positions above Data Entry Operator level (like accountants, consultants, managers etc., and excluding Data Entry Operators, Office Assistants, Stenographers) provided for clients belonging to Central/ State Government Departments OR PSUs OR NGOs OR international social agencies, such as UNICEF/ WHO etc), since April 2015 - >= 20 and <50 – 15 marks - >= 50 and <80 – 20 marks - >=80 – 25 marks	25	31	15	80+	25	21	15
4	ISO 9001:2015 certification	5	Yes	5	Yes	5	Yes	5
5	Average Annual Turnover during FY 2015-16, 2016-17 and 2017-18 - >= Rs. 3 Crore and < 5 Crore – 10 marks - >= Rs. 5 Crore and < 7 Crore – 17.5 marks - > Rs. 7 Crore – 25 marks	25	7+	25	7+	25	7+	25
TOTAL		100		90		100		90

Sd/-
Sanjeev Ranjan,
Manager (Logistics), BMSICL

Sd/-
Mahesh Atri
Manager (Finance), BMSICL

Sd/-
Manish Sinha
DGM (Admin), BMSICL

Sd/-
Ram Sundar Sharma
DGM (Finance), BMSICL

Sd/-
Sunil K Singh
GM (Procurement), BMSICL

Sd/-
Khalid Arshad
Administrative Officer, SHSB